

GIORNALE DI METAFISICA (ISSN 0017-0372)
ANNO XLI - N. 2 - LUGLIO-DICEMBRE 2019

Novecento greco: Socrate, Platone, Aristotele
ISBN 9788837233839 – pp. 288, € 30,00

STEFANO BANCALARI - EMIDIO SPINELLI
stefano.bancalari@uniroma1.it / emidio.spinelli@uniroma1.it
Sapienza, Università di Roma
INTRODUZIONE
(pp. 373-375)

ABSTRACT

Introduzione is the editorial by Stefano Bancalari and Emidio Spinelli, which appeared in the first issue of Giornale di Metafisica (July-December 2019), about the theme of "Novecento Greco".

Keywords: 20th Century, Socrates, Plato, Aristotle

GABRIELLA BAPTIST

baptist@unica.it

Università degli Studi di Cagliari

L'INQUIETUDINE DEL PENSIERO COME POSSIBILITÀ SUPREMA E QUESTIONE LIMITE. IL SOCRATE ESEMPLARE
DI KARL JASPERS

(pp. 376-388)

ABSTRACT

*The essay aims to highlight Jaspers' interpretation of Socrates, with special attention to the first part of his book *The Great Philosophers* (1957). Socrates serves as his starting point in the presentation of paradigmatic individuals – simultaneously within and beyond history – whose role it is to give the measure of philosophical thinking. Jaspers' intention is to offer a new confrontation with tradition, an intellectual form of resistance and a reconstruction of philosophy.*

Keywords: *Jaspers, Socrates, Exemplary Individuals, Thinking, World Philosophy*

ORietta ombrosi

orietta.ombrosi@uniroma1.it

Sapienza, Università di Roma

“IL VENTO DEL PENSIERO”. IL SOCRATE(S) DI HANNAH ARENDT
(pp. 389-404)

ABSTRACT

The multiple facets of Socrates in Hannah Arendt's interpretation of him are more than clear – hence we should speak of Socrates(es), in the plural. There is the Socrates who differs so much from Plato and his great betrayal – that of having ushered in philosophy as metaphysics –; there is the Socrates who remains the master of philosophical practice among the citizens in the agorà; but, perhaps most fascinating of all, there is also the Socrates described as “the wind of thought”, the inventor of “two-in-one”, of critical thinking and moral conscience – in short, the Socrates who laid the foundations for moral and political judgement. Arendt discusses her various images of Socrates(es) and projects her own questions onto him, especially her need to rethink humanity, the human condition, morality and politics, in particular in face of the backdrop of the totalitarian catastrophe and the great shadow it cast.

Keywords: Arendt, Socrates, Critical Thinking, Conscience, “Two-in-one”

EMIDIO SPINELLI

emidio.spinelli@uniroma1.it

Sapienza, Università di Roma

ONTOLOGIA DUALISTICA E VIRTÙ UMANA. IL SOCRATE PLATONICO DI HANS JONAS

(pp. 405-421)

ABSTRACT

This paper aims to collect and present substantial evidence of Hans Jonas's interpretation of Socratic philosophy. Starting from a strong appreciation of Socrates's research method – a positive evaluation widely found in many passages of his works published by Jonas during his life as well as in some unpublished texts – this article will devote more specific attention to a short, but highly significant paper: Socratic Virtue and Wisdom. After examining the close interconnection existing between some Socratic key-concepts (for example: nature, good, ends, knowledge), Jonas here presents Socrates as the champion of a strong idea of theoria, intended as knowledge of the essence and based on a form of (unacceptable) dualism even more radical than the Platonic dualistic approach.

Keywords: *Socrates, Plato, Hans Jonas, Theoria, Dualism*

ELETTRA STIMILLI

elettra.stimilli@uniroma1.it

Sapienza, Università di Roma

SOCRATE ALL'ORIGINE DI UN PUNTO DI SVOLTA. FOUCAULT E IL PREDOMINIO DEL "CONOSCI TE STESSO"
(pp. 422-433)

ABSTRACT

The aim of this essay is to focus the figure of Socrates in Foucault's Course of 1981-1982, The Hermeneutics of the Subject, with particular attention to the reasons why the Delphic maxim "know yourself" (gnothi seautòn) took precedence over the Lacedaemonian maxim "take care of yourself" (epimelei heautoù) in the "Plato's Socrates". A process that has characterized philosophy since its inception, with a decisive change in what Foucault calls the "Cartesian moment". The relevance of this investigation within the Foucaultian path and the peculiarity of his interpretation in the panorama of contemporary philosophy shed new light on the influence of Socratic thought in the Western tradition.

Keywords: *Michel Foucault, Socrates, Self Care, Knowledge, Technology of the Self*

STEFANO BANCALARI

stefano.bancalari@uniroma1.it

Sapienza, Università di Roma

SULLA SOGLIA DELLA METAFISICA. IL *SOFISTA* TRA PLATONE E HEIDEGGER

(pp. 434-447)

ABSTRACT

This article aims to highlight the tension between Heidegger's reading of the Sophist and the interpretive scheme according to which Plato is the founder of Metaphysics conceived as the age of the oblivion of Being. Heidegger works on the «new version of negation» Plato introduced by Plato in Western logic following the «parricide», and he carefully explains the decisive phenomenological consequences of the distinction between “non-being” (which is «blind») and “being-not”, which has an opening and manifestative function. This allows to establish a precise parallelism between the interpretation of me on and the elaboration of the negation which distinguishes between Being and being. It is in the radical “heterogeneity” between them (these two concepts), in which the ontological difference properly consists, that the echo of Heidegger's confrontation with the Platonic hêteron resonates.

Keywords: *Heidegger, Plato, Sophist, Negation, Ontological Difference*

FRANCO TRABATTONI
franco.trabattoni@unimi.it
Università degli Studi di Milano, La Statale
IL PLATONE DI GADAMER, TRA ERMENEUTICA E METAFISICA
(pp. 448-469)

ABSTRACT

Among the images of Plato's philosophy created by twentieth-century thinkers, Heidegger and Gadamer, although the latter was a direct pupil of the former, represent two quite antithetical positions: while for Heidegger Plato is the philosopher founder of metaphysics, and therefore the "villain" to whom we must impute (as R. Bernsetin wrote) everything that has gone wrong in the history of the Western civilization, for Gadamer Plato is above all a Socratic philosopher, therefore dialogical, open-minded and tolerant. The present essay explores the roots of, and the reasons for, this difference, showing also that the approach chosen by Gadamer, though historically and philologically more convincing, however neglects some essential aspects of Plato's thought.

Keywords: *Plato, Heidegger, Gadamer, Metaphysics, Dialogue, Dialectic Ontology, Recollection*

CATERINA BOTTI

caterina.botti@uniroma1.it

Sapienza, Università di Roma

IL BENE E IL SOLE. METAFORE PLATONICHE NEL PENSIERO DI IRIS MURDOCH

(pp. 470-487)

ABSTRACT

The aim of this paper is to explore the occurrence, the extension and use of themes and metaphors coming from Plato's philosophy in Iris Murdoch's works. To this end Murdoch's early and central production will be examined. It will be shown how, against the background of her critique of British analytic philosophy and existentialism, Plato's themes and metaphors emerge in Murdoch's attempt to propose a more fitting image of both philosophy and human moral life.

Keywords: *Murdoch, Plato, Moral Life, Goodness, Metaphors*

MARIO DE CARO

mario.decaro@uniroma3.it

Università Roma Tre e Tufts University

FISICA E ONTOLOGIA. LE RADICI ANTICHE DI UNA DISCUSSIONE CONTEMPORANEA

(pp. 448-501)

ABSTRACT

The contemporary discussion on physicalism opposes philosophers such as Alex Rosenberg, Jaegwon Kim, and Hartry Field, who believe that our ontology and epistemology could in principle be determined by physics, to other philosophers who deny the ontological and epistemological primacy of physics (for example Plantinga's antinaturalism, Putnam's liberal naturalism or van Fraassen's instrumentalism). This article argues that this discussion is the latest chapter of a very long history, which began in the later years of the Renaissance, when the Platonist philosophers claimed, whereas the Aristotelian party denied, that the world is intrinsically mathematical and that only a mathematized physics can account for it.

Keywords: *Physicalism, Platonism, Aristotelism, Naturalism, Antinaturalism*

SILVIA GASTALDI
silvia.gastaldi@unipv.it
Università di Pavia

ARGOMENTAZIONE E ADESIONE DELL'UDITORIO: PERELMAN E ARISTOTELE
(pp. 502-516)

ABSTRACT

*The aim of Perelman's Treatise on Argumentation is to develop an argumentation theory to be used for value judgments, in which the tools of formal logic cannot be employed. Perelman defines his theory as a new rhetoric, and states he is referring to the ancient Greek and Latin authors, in particular to Aristotle. The essay analyses the similarities between Perelman's argumentation theory and Aristotle's rhetoric and dialectic, but also highlights their conflicting aspects. In particular, Perelman's notion of 'reasonable', as opposed to that of 'necessary', typical of demonstrative logic, is compared to with Aristotle's *èndoxon*, that is, to what corresponds to commonly held opinions. The essay also examines the role assigned by both authors to the audience, since the purpose of argumentation is to obtain the agreement of listeners. In this regard, Perelman's theory of universal audience is discussed in depth.*

Keywords: *Perelman, Aristotle, Argumentation, Rhetoric, Audience*

ENRICO BERTI
enrico.ber ti@unipd.it
Università degli Studi di Padova
HILARY PUTNAM E “ARISTOTELE DOPO WITTGENSTEIN”
(pp. 517-524)

ABSTRACT

The article shows how Putnam at first attributed to Aristotle a type of functionalism and later a true hylomorphism, considering this latter theory the better solution to the Mind-Body Problem. In particular, in his book Words and Life (1994), Putnam declared that the Aristotelian notion of metaphysical form explains human knowledge better than the notion of “logical form” proposed by Wittgenstein. More recently, in his book Philosophy in the Age of Science (2012), Putnam criticizes the causal theory of reference attributed to Aristotle by Victor Caston. The article then replies to some criticisms addressed by Putnam to Aristotle and proposes a new interpretation of the verb noein used by Aristotle.

Keywords: *Aristotle, Wittgenstein, Putnam, Functionalism, Hylomorphism*

R. LOREDANA CARDULLO

l.cardullo@unict.it

Università degli Studi di Catania

IL NEO-ARISTOTELISMO DI MARTHA NUSSBAUM ATTUALIZZAZIONE O DISTORSIONE STORICA?

(pp. 525-539)

ABSTRACT

The aim of this contribution is to reconstruct the characteristics of the so-called “Neo-Aristotelianism” of Martha Nussbaum. It also purports to verify whether the recourse to Aristotle as a source of inspiration for her theory for an egalitarian, liberal and social democracy, is correct and comprehensive, or, on the contrary, if it represents a forced as well as anachronistic interpretation of the Stagirite’s thought.

Keywords: Neo-Aristotelianism, Nussbaum, Social Democracy, Liberalism, Ethics

PIERGIORGIO DONATELLI
piergiorgio.donatelli@uniroma1.it
Sapienza, Università di Roma
WITTGENSTEIN, L'ETICA E LA FILOSOFIA ANTICA
(pp. 540-552)

ABSTRACT

The article proposes a reading of various perspectives in contemporary ethics, all connected to Wittgenstein's philosophy, offered as ways of continuing certain lines of thought broached by the ancients. Wittgenstein inspired a criticism of a theoretical conception of ethics embraced by diverse authors. The authors selected here for analysis are Cavell and Foucault: the former directly offering his notion of moral perfectionism as an interpretation of Wittgenstein's philosophy, whereas Foucault's perspective on the self as an object of work and care may be usefully connected to Cavell's approach. While Foucault's inspiration goes back to the tradition of the art of life, Cavell is mistakenly considered as a theorist of the art of life, given his emphasis on the skeptical adventures faced by the self in its prospect of progress.

Keywords: *Wittgenstein, Theory, Stanley Cavell, Moral Perfectionism*

ALESSANDRA MODUGNO
alessandra.modugno@unige.it
Università degli Studi di Genova
DILATARE IL PENSIERO CRITICO
(pp. 555-569)

ABSTRACT

Critical thinking implies an approach toward reality capable of discerning and evaluating its factors supposedly fostering free and pro-active attitudes. However, “critical thinking” is in itself ambiguous. Firstly, being “philosophically critical” means a radical unhypothetical way of conceiving thought; secondly, it refers to techniques allowing validity, correctness and reliability of thinking process. Thus, philosophy risks to be reduced to a procedural know-how. This essay aims at broadening the conception of critical thinking by offering a complex model where operativeness becomes part of vital open dialogue among subjects within a common relation to truth as criterion and fabric of any communication.

Keywords: *Criticism, Learning, Philosophical Thinking, Social Dialogue, Truth*

ORESTE TOLONE

orestetolone@gmail.com

Università degli Studi di Chieti-Pescara “Gabriele d’Annunzio”

ANTROPOLOGIA DELLO STATO D’ECCEZIONE. CARL SCHMITT, ARNOLD GEHLEN, HELMUTH PLESSNER
(pp. 573-587)

ABSTRACT

The essay starts from the assumption that there is no political philosophy that does not presuppose an anthropology or an image of man. At the same time, there does not exist an anthropology and image of man that has no political implications. The increasingly evident affirmation of the «state of exception as a rule» – theorized by Schmitt, Benjamin and taken up by Agamben – necessary to face constant and repeated states of emergency, poses the problem of understanding what kind of anthropology (what kind of man) is that connected with this contemporary policy. The essay identifies Plessner’s and, above all, Gehlen’s anthropologies’ turning point as a counterpart to the state of exception, with the emotional aggravation and overload of decisionality that the crisis of the institutions entails.

Keywords: State of Exception, Philosophical Anthropology, Schmitt, Gehlen, Plessner

STEFANO MICALI
stefano.micali@hiw.kuleuven.be
Husserl Archives Leuven
CORPOREITÀ, FANTASIA E ATTESA DEL FUTURO NELL'ANGOSCIA
(pp. 588-603)

ABSTRACT

The author intends to investigate anxiety from a phenomenological perspective. The paper is divided into two sections. In the first section the author examines the notion of anxiety through a critical discussion of Hermann Schmitz's account. In Schmitz's view, anxiety occurs at a very specific moment: Anxiety arises from the tension between one's own intention to move away and the impossibility of performing this action. Schmitz conceives of anxiety in terms of an impeded impulse to flee, to go away [gehindertes Weg!]. In the second section the author attempts to offer a positive description of a phenomenology of anxiety by highlighting how the dimensions of phantasy [Phantasie] and the anticipation of the future play a fundamental role in our experience of anxiety. In so doing the author shows the limits of the Schmitzian approach to anxiety.

Keywords: *Anxiety, New Phenomenology, Corporeity, Phantasy, Hermann Schmitz*

GAETANO CHIURAZZI
gaetano.chiurazzi@unito.it
Università degli Studi di Torino
DERRIDA E L'INFINITO
(pp. 604-619)

ABSTRACT

Derrida's deconstruction entails the appearance of a structure of infinity, as infinite divisibility and as infinite referral, both inscribed in the concept of différance. The former occurs in the deconstruction of the "principle of all principles" in Husserl's phenomenology, i.e. of intuition, and of the atomistic presuppositions of the traditional concept of truth as correspondence. The latter occurs in relation to some of the ethical concepts of deconstruction, such as gift or justice. The main ideas that underpin this discussion are that a) this appearance of infinity is both the cause and the consequence of the deconstruction of the metaphysics of presence; b) this infinity is the very structure of temporal being, i.e. of finitude; c) infinity is not a substance in itself, but what makes every metaphysics of substance impossible. In this sense, it is more an operator (a deconstructive operator) than a concept of something real.

Keywords: *Derrida, Infinite, Finitude, Deconstruction, Différance*

ANDREA LE MOLI
andrea.lemoli@unipa.it
Università degli Studi di Palermo
SOGGETTIVITÀ, IDENTITÀ, METAFISICA. DA CARTESIO A WITTGENSTEIN
(pp. 620-634)

ABSTRACT

In recent articles I analysed the relationship between the proposals for a critique or “reformation” of metaphysics formulated according to the analytical and the continental points of view, underlining how in the former case there was an interest not so much in definitively dismissing metaphysics as in purifying it from obscure notions. In particular, I focussed on the way in which the notions of “totality” and “absolute” have been thoroughly reconsidered within a metaphysics that has been oriented towards a plane of scientific consistency. This essay aims to verify whether the notion of subjectivity could be considered another of the “great renunciations” on which many scholars of contemporary metaphysics seem to agree, or if it is rather one of those notions that can be maintained after they have been reformulated.

Keywords: *Subjectivity, Metaphysics, Ontology, Identity, Objectivity*

CLAUDIA ROSCIGLIONE
claudia.rosciglione@unipa.it
Università degli Studi di Palermo

*INTENZIONALITÀ COLLETTIVA VERSUS PLURAL SUBJECT NEL CONFRONTO TRA SEARLE E GILBERT. INFLUSSI
HOBBSIANI E ROUSSEAUIANI NEL DIBATTITO CONTEMPORANEO SU INDIVIDUALISMO E COLLETTIVISMO
(pp. 635-650)*

ABSTRACT

In this paper I will take into account Margaret Gilbert's theory of joint commitment and plural subject and John Searle's theory of collective intentionality. In particular I will discuss their view on the phrase «individuals as a group», which bears an intrinsic tension between the individuals, treated as manifold and plural entities, and the group, treated as one singular entity. These theories do hold in common the attempt to go beyond the view that both the collective dimension is reducible to the individual dimension and that the collectivity is a subject endowed with a group mind. However, they give it a different articulation. I will submit an interpretation, then, to account for this difference. On the one hand, the We, which Searle ascribes to the collective intentionality, stems from the cooperation between two or more individuals and is founded on the fact that they remain irreducible to the constitution of the We. On the other hand, in Gilbert's theory the concept of the joint commitment attributes a fundamental role to the plurality and irreducibility of individuals, but the concept of the plural subject is in fact consistent with a strong collectivism according to which We is something unique, absolute and supra-individual.

Keywords: *Individualism, Collectivism, Plural Subject, Joint Commitment, Collective Intentionality*